



UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X
VALLAIR SOLUTIONS SARL

Plaintiff,

- against -

321 PRECISION CONVERSIONS LLC

Defendant.
-----X

21-CV-7507 (CM) (RWL)

ORDER

ROBERT W. LEHRBURGER, United States Magistrate Judge.

This order resolves Defendant Precision's letter motions to compel a more fulsome answer to First Set of Interrogatories No. 22, and to compel answers to Precision's Second Set of Interrogatories. See Dkt. 125, 126.

1. Vallair must supplement its answer to First Set Interrogatory No. 22 to the extent that Vallair must identify documents, by Bates Number, to which it refers in regard to damages. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 33(d). Additionally, Vallair must elaborate on what it means by investment costs, out of pocket costs, direct and indirect costs, et al. The Court does not agree that Vallair's current answer is comparable to Precision's response to interrogatory number 13 posed to Precision; Precision explained the framework it asserts for determining its damages and also provided specific dollar amount for a portion of those damages. To be clear, however, Vallair need not set forth specific calculations or every cost or identify every cost in detail; Vallair is correct that expert disclosures should provide a full analysis.

2. Vallair must answer Second Set of Interrogatories No. 1, 4, and 12. The other interrogatories asking to "identify the/all facts" are not contention interrogatories;

improperly call for lengthy narrative answers; and are not the most practical and efficient means of obtaining such information.

The Clerk of Court is respectfully requested to terminate the letter motions at Dkt. 125 and 126.

SO ORDERED.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'R. Lehrburger', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

ROBERT W. LEHRBURGER
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Dated: May 1, 2023
New York, New York

Copies transmitted this date to all counsel of record.